

CT-10

Lake County Sheriff's Office

Sheriff Daniel A. Dunlap

104 East Erie Street . Painesville, Ohio 44077 . (440) 350-5517 . Fax: (440) 350-5630

MEMORANDUM

TO: Board of Lake County Commissioners
Robert E. Aufuldish, President
Raymond E. Sines
Daniel P. Troy

FROM: Chief Deputy *William E. Crosier*
William E. Crosier

DATE: October 17, 2005

RE: **RESOLUTION ENDORSING USE OF THE MATRICULA CONSULAR
ISSUED BY THE MEXICAN CONSULATE FOR IDENTIFICATION
PURPOSES**

05 OCT 18 12:30

RECEIVED
CO. COMM. CLERKS OFFICE
LAKE CO. OHIO

We are recently in receipt of the above-mentioned Resolution, passed October 13, 2005. We would like to call to your attention our concerns with this matter based on the following attached documents:

The Congressional Testimony of Steve McGraw, Assistant Director of the Office of Intelligence, FBI, before the House Judiciary Subcommittee on Immigration, Border Security, and Claims, on Consular ID Cards, on June 26, 2003.

During this testimony, Director McGraw stated:

... The U.S. Government has done an extensive amount of research on the Matricula Consular, to assess its viability as a reliable means of identification. The Department of Justice and the FBI have concluded that the Matricula Consular is not a reliable form of identification, due to the non-existence of any means of verifying the true identity of the card holder. The following are the primary problems with the Matricula Consular that allow criminals to fraudulently obtain the cards:

First, the Government of Mexico has no centralized database to coordinate the issuance of consular ID cards. This allows multiple cards to be issued under the same name, the same address, or with the same photograph.

Second, the Government of Mexico has no interconnected databases to provide intra-consular communications to be able to verify who has or has not applied for or received a consular ID card.

Third, the Government of Mexico issues the card to anyone who can produce a Mexican birth certificate and one other form of identity, including documents of very low reliability. Mexican birth certificates are easy to forge and they are a major item on the product list of the fraudulent document trade currently flourishing across the country and around the world. A September 2002 bust of a document production operation in Washington State illustrated the size of this trade. A huge cache of fake Mexican birth certificates was discovered. It is our belief that the primary reason a market for these birth certificates exists is the demand for fraudulently-obtained Matricula Consular cards.

Fourth, in some locations, when an individual seeking a Matricula Consular is unable to produce any documents whatsoever, he will still be issued a Matricula Consular by the Mexican consular official, if he fills out a questionnaire and satisfies the official that he is who he purports to be.

In addition to being vulnerable to fraud, the Matricula Consular is also vulnerable to forgery. There have been several generations of the card, and even the newest version can be easily replicated, despite its security features. It is our estimate that more than 90 percent of Matricula Consular cards now in circulation are earlier versions of the card, which are little more than simple laminated cards without any security features.

As a result of these problems, there are two major criminal threats posed by the cards, and one potential terrorist treat:

- (1) The first criminal threats stems from the fact that the Matricula Consular can be a perfect breeder document for establishing a false identity.*
- (2) The second criminal threat is that of alien smuggling, a crime that has resulted in many deaths within the past year.*

Also attached is correspondence, under date of April 19, 2005, to All Regional Directors of the Food Stamp Program from Arthur T. Foley, Director of the Program Development Division regarding Mexico's Matricula Consular Identification stating that

"It is not sufficient to verify an immigrant's legal immigration status in the U.S. or eligibility for benefits under the Food stamp Program."

Thirdly, I am enclosing comments from Congressman Gary Miller, of the 42 Congressional District, stating that the cards are not reliable identification (see attached).

Lastly, I am enclosing an article from the Center for Immigration Studies which, in part, highlights that:

- *"The Matricula Consular is useful in the United States only for illegal aliens, since legal immigrants, by definition, have U.S. government-issued documents.*

- *The Mexican government has launched an aggressive grassroots lobbying campaign to win acceptance for its Matricula card from state and local jurisdictions and from banks, especially in areas where Mexican illegal aliens are concentrated.*
- *The objective of this lobbying effort is to achieve quasi-legal status for Mexican illegals in the United States without waiting for action from Washington.*
- *The Matricula itself, however, is useful to illegal aliens only insofar as U.S. institutions are willing to collaborate with Mexico's efforts to circumvent U.S. immigration law.*
- *While many jurisdictions have resisted pressure from the Mexican government, others have not; the Matricula is now accepted by 800 local law enforcement agencies and 74 banks, as well as by 13 states for purposes of obtaining a driver's license.*
- *Not only does the Matricula subvert U.S. Immigration Law, it is not even a secure identity document. Mexico is not authenticating the documents used to obtain the Matricula against computerized data files in Mexico.*
- *Safeguards are not in place to prevent multiple issuance of Matriculas to the same individual; in fact, the INS has already reported finding multiple cards in different names issued to the same person.*
- *The Matricula is becoming a shield that hides criminal activity for two reasons: First, the holder's identity was not verified when the card was issued, and second, police in jurisdictions that accept the Matricula are less likely to run background checks on card holders picked up for minor infractions.*
- *The U.S. Treasury Department has given its approval to banks to accept the Matricula for opening bank accounts.*
- *The acceptance of Mexico's Matricula Consular sets a precedent, making it almost impossible to reject similar cards presented by illegal aliens from other countries, including those which have sent terrorists to the United States in the past."*

Based on all of these materials, we are concerned as to The Matricula Consular identification being a reliable source of identification and suggest that you may want to further research this matter.

WEC:sz
Attachments

cc: Charles E. Coulson, Prosecuting Attorney
Pat Nocero, Asst. Prosecuting Attorney
Amy Elszasz, Clerk of the Board of County Commissioners